

---

---

# Ashland City Council

---

MINUTES FOR THE REGULAR SESSION OF COUNCIL  
Tuesday, November 17, 2009 7:00 p.m.  
Council Chambers  
3<sup>rd</sup> floor

---

---

Council President Paul Wertz called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

## ROLL CALL

At-large:	Stephen Stuart	Present
Ward 1:	Robert L. Valentine	Present
Ward 2:	Robert M. Valentine	Present
Ward 3:	Ruth Detrow	Present
Ward 4/President:	Paul Wertz	Present

Note: Throughout the minutes, Robert L. Valentine and Robert M. Valentine are designated as to their ward representation, W1 and W2.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

## PRESENTATION OF MINUTES

*Regular Session 11/3/09*

*Special Session/Executive Session 11/3/09*

*Motion to accept the Minutes of Regular Session 11/3/09 by Paul Wertz, approved by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

No Corrections. Approved as noted.

*Motion to accept the Minutes from Special Session/Executive Session 11/3/09 by Paul Wertz, approved by Robert L. Valentine W1, seconded by Paul Wertz.*

*Ayes: Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Abstain: Stephen Stuart*

No corrections. Approved as noted.

*PRESENTATION by Evan Scurti- 7:05, Economic Development, AACED: Updates in Economic Development.*

**EVAN SCURTI:** I just wanted to update you on some things our office has been working on for the past year. I will get into some more immediate projects and initiatives that we are working on. As you have heard me talk in the past, we try and divide our work into the three pillars of Economic Development. Working with our existing manufacturing base, the industrial base of the community. Working with them, trying to grow their businesses. Secondly, we try and do a lot of marketing out of our office and in business improvement into our available sites of buildings in the Business Park for example. And thirdly, it is important probably now more than ever, as we are in a recession to grow your own businesses, entrepreneurship, new business forma-

tion from our own citizens. We are trying to work on all of that. What I have given you is some excerpts from our 2009/2010 action plan; so I just wanted to break out my comments and show you what we are doing to seek out those goals and objectives. Anything you see in black is just a copy from our action plan and then what I have done, putting in red there, some current things we are working on; just wanted to bring your attention to them. The first section, Retention & Expansion, that is a fancy term that our profession calls checking in with the existing businesses, working with them and help them in their success. The first project we listed in our plan was continuing the process of our bi-annual survey. We have been doing that in the community every other year. We try and survey the entire manufacturing base. That is the goal. I think we have gotten to about as high as 80-85%. The ambitious goal every other year, but we are getting close this year. We are using a team of volunteers, about 10 individuals from the career center, job and family services, the small business development center. They are all helping us reach out to the manufacturing base and survey them. We sit down and talk for about ½ hour, 40 minutes. The survey is designed to 1) see if there are any red flags, are there any companies really in trouble that we really need to pay attention to, but also look at opportunities to grow companies. I haven't seen any extreme red flags. Of course we are hearing many times, business is down, no surprise with the recession but a lot of good things coming out of this survey. What I want to draw your attention to is that one phrase there I included. Economic Gardening. Again, another fancy term, but it is in the Economic Development literature I have been reading. It is really a concept that is taking off. Simply put; we have got to do more than just check on the companies every other year. We have moved into more of a small business environment throughout the country. Businesses are working together more and more collaboratively for competitive advantages and there are opportunities for us as economic developers to make those connections among our local businesses. So again, a fancy term for gardening. Working with your businesses throughout that 2-year term, making those connections and just tending to the garden of the local economies. So I am really challenging my staff and my board to focus on that concept. We are seeing some good results already and we will be publishing a report later this year, maybe early 2010, results of this survey connecting a lot of businesses, small businesses to our larger companies. Just constantly trying to make those large firms aware of the opportunities and the services of our smaller firms. We are putting together some round tables. Already that is coming out of the surveys, some small businesses that we are noticing, in the same market, but are competitors and they are wanting to get together and strategize sales and marketing plans together. So, we are working on those things, more to come in a couple of months. Also, just so you are aware, I am currently working with Ashland University, to help them facilitate some meetings with businesses. They are starting a supply in management curriculum as part of their business college. So they have asked for my assistance in reaching out to companies like Lance, Truck lines in Loudonville. A lot of companies associated with logistics; they are going to meet and possibly become an advisory counsel for Ashland University. The relationship with AU and our business community I think is getting stronger every day. Moving on into Workforce Development; we talked about that in our plan. It is more and more important talent that is driving business success in today's economy. We are emphasizing in the survey, as we meet with companies, the services of Erv Howard. You may know Herb, he lives in Ashland but his position is a Regional Training Coordinator for the State of Ohio. It covers nine counties, north central Ohio and he not only talks to companies about possible incentives and assistance in their training plans. But he can help them actually development a training plan or quality program. He has worked at several large industries at high-level management positions. So he is getting more and more involved in our economy. Secondly, just a few days ago, over \$600,000 dollars, you can see there, was approved to train dislocated workers and incumbent workers in the four counties that are most effected by the GM Plant closure; so we are going to be working with Job and Family Services to start to market those dollars.

**Mayor Stewart:** Evan, excuse me. Is that limited to GM workers?

**Evan Scurti:** No, no; the Grant application, it came out of Richland Job and Family Services; they focused on those counties just because of the negative impact.

**Mayor Stewart:** So those who are unemployed or are out of work in Ashland County will be able to...

**Evan Scurti:** Yes, of this \$600,000 we have \$112,000 allocated to Ashland County. I should have put that in there.

**Mayor Stewart:** That is really what we are looking; we are selfishly interested.

**Evan Scurti:** They approved it based on the population. 60% of that \$112,000 has to be for dislocated worker training. 40% is for incumbent worker training. I will be talking to Gary Hannan, Job and Family Services. I will work primarily on that 40% average, talking with companies about it. They are looking to do some training with some nice assistants. It can cover up to 90% of the training cost if you are a small company.

**Stephen Stuart:** Will the training basically be in-house training by companies? Is that right?

**Evan Scurti:** Yes, it can bring the trainer in-house or if you want to go to classes. If you want to customize your own class, sometimes we have to try and group companies together to make it worthwhile for the consultant to put on class. This is just one of several programs actually. There are a lot of programs. A lot of them are stimulus-related programs coming down from the Federal Government into the state. But I wanted to list this one. This is one of the very little strings attached. Basically, it gives us local community control over approving these accounts. So moving on into the section 3. We want to really focus on emerging markets. There are a lot of opportunities for our companies in the advanced energy markets, biosciences, etc. So we are really trying to focus on that. I have just listed some of the seminars we have hosted this year. Many of you attended the Wind and the Polymers seminar. More recently we had the Solar Industry seminar. We brought in some speakers from the stage as well as an individual from the farm bureau who has is really studying this industry. It was a good session; it has led to some follow up. Discussions, many companies seeking training to try and get solar panel installers. What was also discussed at this seminar was this concept of solar improvement districts and Mayor we have discussed this a little bit. It is a new state law, just passed in July, that allows municipalities and townships to create solar districts where a group of homeowners and/or businesses; they don't have to be contiguous properties. If they want to band together and list some solar improvements that they want to make to their properties, the community, if they choose, can create a district and fund those improvements up front whether it is through the sale, or some communities like the city of Athens is the first in Ohio. They are purchasing the improvements through a Revolving Loan fund by getting a Grant through the Federal Government and then those improvements are paid off by the property owner. It is a special assessment onto the tax. We are just learning about it. I may request to come back here soon to talk further about it actually. We are going to try and see if there is interest in the community, because that is the first step. If there is interest, a lot of people are looking to make these investments. It is a great way to help them and it is a great way to continue to move our economy towards this markets. Moving on into marketing and business attraction. Just wanted to emphasize there that we are trying to get creative. The situation we are in, we can't just wait for leads anymore. In good times, sometimes it is easier to just wait for those leads to roll in through the state system. Many large corporations work first with state level governments to look for incentives. And then we respond to those requests. That process continues but it has declined drastically. The amount of leads coming through the state system, as you can imagine. We are trying to be very creative in addition to working with those state wide industry groups that I mentioned like Polymer Ohio and Great Lakes Wind Network because those groups do a lot of marketing around the globe so we want to have close ties with those industry groups. We are also focusing on relationships with our current businesses. This comes out of our survey that we are doing as well. The retention and expansion survey. There are some questions in there about other opportunities to work with your suppliers or customers, now potentially recruiting them into the community. So that is actually leading to, not, I wouldn't call them hot leads, but at least discussions. Some contacts that I can maybe enlist potential sales calls, if you will. And they are generated right from our own companies. They are our best vehicle, in my opinion. We talked in our plan about focusing on rail-related business development. When we published the plan, gas prices were even higher. We were seeing a lot of companies opening a rail transportation. It is still continuing. A lot of companies are looking at rail. The expansion into the Industrial Park is definitely a huge asset for us in my opinion. And as I mentioned, that we are currently in discussion with the company again. Not a hot lead, but it is a discussion. A company that is taking a look at the midwest and the

fact that we have rail in the Business Park. They said that now we are on the radar screen, because that is another key, utility for them, just as it was from Barbasol. So, I think it is great. And then marketing to Ashland natives, Ashland University. That is something we want to try and we are in 2010. Just reach out to people with connections, to their hometown, to their college town. Try and generate leads that way. You can see their addition to mass mailings were planning the even with the International Students Office with Ashland University. Just another way to make connections welcoming them into the community. These are also students; many of them Business students that may have business ideas for the future. This is the meeting in February we discussed. We will have a lunch in February just to welcome new students.

**Mayor Stewart:** Evan, there are numerous international students at AU whose parents or family are entrepreneurs either on our shores or on their native shores. I think this is the connection opportunity. Don't know if any of them will develop or not. But as Evan is saying, this is part of the Gardening process, but over in another area.

**Evan Scurti:** Yes, it is all about trying to make this connection. Moving into Entrepreneurship; just some comments there. Number one, we talked about possibly utilizing a committee; it is something I am really passionate about. I want to see new ideas, new products coming out of this community. And I think that is still happening. A committee to meet regularly didn't seem to work out, but overall we are operating under that philosophy. We are constantly trying to engage citizens. My assistant, Nikki, just worked with the Chamber and the Salvation Army. We co-hosted a nice seminar for Women Entrepreneurs during our Women's Business Month in September. That was a great event. It led to several leads for the small business development center. Katherine Goodwin from the SBDC she presented.

She is actually following up with several of the Ladies. One gentleman called and said, Can I come to this? I said, sure, if you want to start a business. So we are going to continue doing that. Those types of events. Again, simply put, we want to meet with people. We want to hear your ideas. We are not business counselors. I am not going to be your best counselor to put together a business plan up and launch that business but we are, I think, getting good at connecting people to the right resources, to the SBDC and just being a sounding board for our citizens. We need new ideas. We need new product development and actually that may be a seminar we are going to pursue in early 2010. Focus on new product concepts. Whether you are a citizen out of work or you are an existing company looking at a new product line. I want to bring in some speakers. We are working with one client right now on a potential jump-start project. If you remember, Jump Start is in northeast Ohio. It is focused on new business development; but really high growth projects. They try to focus on start-ups. There are in the 30 to 50 million-dollar revenue range, within five years they want to see you get to that point. So these are high growth ideas where Venture Capital Management advice mentoring is often needed so we are connecting someone right now to jump-start the resources. Their office is in Cleveland. And then finally, over the past couple of months, I have been working with my colleagues in Crawford, Richland and Huron counties. We are looking at creating a revolving loan fund to assist small business development. This would be what is called Gap findings. A bank wants to share the risk and partner with the community fund and they would reach out to us and we would share the fund a small business growth and start up. I will probably be coming back to you soon to talk about that. We would have to apply for funds from the Federal Government to capitalize the RLF. It would be unique. It would operate on a regional level. Again we are playing up the GM closure statistics. Our four counties were most affected. Of course Richland, much more than the other three. But our four were most affected in terms of displaced workers. So we are trying to tell that story to the Federal Government and ask them for help. We will be coming back to maybe as a group, my colleagues and I and we are going to travel around the region and talk about this concept in a couple of months. That is about it, I also added that we are focused on re-development and that I also strongly believe in is being a facilitator of re-development of idle sites and buildings. The main update, the transfer of the Hospira Land to the CIC. It is going well; it takes a while to get back the Stamp of Approval, if you will, from the state. We are taking it through the voluntary process where at the end the state will say, we have given you are covenant not to sue. We won't come after you and look into the site any further as long as it is used for industry in the future. Last thing, you should have gotten our invitation December 1, is our next investor meeting. You may have to hear some of this again. More important, address the keynote speaker will be Tony Bresch. It should be interesting.

One community is the nonprofit, based out of Cleveland. They are putting Broadband throughout. I think it is up to like 21 towns in the northeast and northern Ohio. They are going to connect first to institutions, Universities and Hospitals. They are in conversation with Samaritan Hospital. So it should be an interesting presentation.

**Mayor Stewart:** Is that 9:00 at the Kroc Center?

**Evan Scurti:** Yes, Kroc Center, 9:00 a.m. December 1, 2009.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** You know I was making a list while you were talking. The different things that we have in our city and county. I put down like:

Hospital	Highways, 30 and 71
Good schools, public and private	Railroad
Good connecting roads	
Good workforce	
Parks	
Water	
University	

The point is, the competition is so great now. Don't take this wrong, business has the advantage, simply because they are somewhat in the driver seat and that is understandable. But I think we have a lot of good things going for us. I just mentioned a few; you could probably mention a lot more too. I think it is an ideal place to raise children. An ideal community.

**Evan Scurti:** And what is interesting is, I am thinking of one small business that we met with as we were doing our survey. We got to the question, do you have any suppliers or customers that we should call on. He thought and said, yes I know some in Korea. He has actually been here, actually toured the town already but he just never thought to connect it to me and that is okay but that is why we do this survey to make those connections. But those kind of relationships, he has already seen the community and already knows Ashland.

Questions or discussion? None.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** I appreciate you coming in.

**PRESENTATION of the [Minutes from the Board of Revision of Assessments 10/28/09](#): RE: to vacate a certain 16-foot north-south alley.**

**Mayor Stewart:** I have the minutes of that meeting. It was held on the 28<sup>th</sup> of October at 10:15 am in the Mayor's office.

Present: Mayor Glen Stewart  
Law Director Richard Wolfe  
Acting Director of Finance Division Bill Strine

*The meeting was called to order pursuant to Section 105 of the Charter of the City of Ashland to consider the vacation of the following alley as described in Resolution 17-09.*

*To vacate: being a certain 16 foot north-south alley, situated between Lot nos. 541, 542, 543, 544 and 776 north of Ashland from the north line of Lot no. 542, north Ashland being the south right-of-way line of West 10<sup>th</sup> Street (36') to the south line of Lot No. 776 north Ashland being the north right-of-way line of a certain 16 foot east-west alley.*

*After discussion and consideration of public input from the hearing held on October 20, 2009, a motion to approve the vacation of said alley was made by Mayor Stewart and seconded by Strine.*

*Ayes: Stewart, Wolfe, Strine*

*Meeting Adjourned at 10:32 a.m.*

*Attest:       /s/ William E. Strine \_\_, Secretary  
William E. Strine*

*Approved:       /s/ Glen P. Stewart \_\_, President  
Glen P. Stewart*

*(copy on file in Council clerks office)*

## **LEGISLATION:**

### Ordinances:

#### **Ord. No. 79-09**

Item (a) AN ORDINANCE TO VACATE A CERTAIN ALLEY SITUATED IN THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. (W 10<sup>TH</sup> STREET)

*Moved for non-reading in full by Ruth Detrow and seconded by Paul Wertz to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Comments or questions

*Moved by Robert M. Valentine W2, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to suspend the rules, 3 separate meetings, 3 separate nights, by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move the Ordinance be passed by Stephen Stuart, seconded by Robert M. Valentine W2.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Motion carried.

#### **Ord. No. 80-09**

Item (b) AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR OF THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO, TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT EXTENSION AGREEMENT WITH THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF FIRE FIGHTERS LOCAL 1386, AFL-CIO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

*Moved for non-reading in full by Paul Wertz, seconded by Ruth Detrow, to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Comments or questions? None.

**Mayor Stewart:** You all have been brought up to speed on this Ordinance.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** It is just for one year, is that right?

**Mayor Stewart:** That is correct.

*Moved to pass the Ordinance on the first reading by Robert M. Valentine W2, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to suspend the rules, 3 separate meetings, 3 separate nights, by Paul Wertz, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move the Ordinance be passed by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Motion carried.

**Ord. 81-09**

Item (c) AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SERVICE, TO ENTER INTO A MODIFICATION OF THE U.S. RT. 250 SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENT PROJECT-PHASE 1 PROJECT – ELITE EXCAVATING COMPANY CONTRACT AUTHORIZED BY ORDINANCE NO. 29-09; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

*Move for non-reading in full by Robert M. Valentine W2, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1 to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

**Shane Kremser:** This is a contract modification request for the U.S. 250 Sanitary Sewer Relief Project. The changes pertain to two things. First thing was a project delay due to error in admission related to an ODOT permit for working within the ODOT right-of-way, limited access right-of-way which both the city and the consultant were not aware of. The second one is for directional Bore extension, approximately about 50 feet. Where they extended the bore to alleviate some potential conflicts with adjacent pavements and existing utilities. The total is for \$10,714.50.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** The only question I have is the estimate was \$336,000 and the project was \$212,000. I like those.

**Shane Kremser:** Yes we were getting pretty good bids.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** A few more change orders, it will be back up to \$336,000.

**Stephen Stuart:** Do we have any contractual obligation to pay the additional \$6,000.00 for the delay?

**Shane Kremser:** Contractually, the legality of it, I am not real sure. I thought it was the right thing to do to try and do this because Elite Excavating was the one that called ODOT and they called on a Friday, before they

were supposed to start and that is how ODOT became aware of the project. If Elite had not called, it would have been a lot worse because we would have gotten stopped by ODOT.

**Stephen Stuart:** ODOT didn't know about the project because?

**Mayor Stewart:** It was a failure on our part and on the part of the consultant to go to ODOT and request this permit. We, the city of Ashland, authorized this contractor to commence construction in the fact that he could facilitate the equipment in and get it set up. The equipment came in on a Wednesday and that is when we verbally called them and gave them permission to start. On Friday afternoon, we sent them emails, faxes or a verbal, anyway we contacted them in numerous ways to tell them that they couldn't. There have been some negotiations on the cost of the equipment being there and we have gone forward with this. Didn't it start at \$9,000.00 dollars?

**Shane Kremser:** Yes.

**Stephen Stuart:** How long was the delay?

**Shane Kremser:** I believe it was three weeks. Now typically, for instance, we are doing a project on East Liberty and 250 and that is an ODOT right-of-way. My opinion is we get something from ODOT in writing saying that we don't need a permit, so when we get all of our plans for that project, we are going to submit to ODOT and I have already made some contracts with the traffic engineer at ODOT do the same for the roadway. So this is something that it was kind of an oversight, I am not sure whom; I looked through Arcadis's contract. It doesn't specifically state that Arcadis is responsible for obtaining permits, so it was kind of a legal thing here and there. The contractor wanted compensation because they felt that they were the ones that identified the issue and they were the ones that stopped all their equipment prematurely. It could be argued that they didn't have any damages, but we don't know; they said the equipment was there the whole time. They didn't come and get it. But if it came down to the legality of it, I am not sure. That is why I talked to consultant and the consultant agreed to split half the cost and what we are going to do, is on another project that they are working on for us, they are going to eat \$3,000.00 dollars and spend extra time and not bill us for it. So hopefully in the future, this is just something that won't happen again.

Comments or questions.

*Move to pass the Ordinance on the first reading by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1  
Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to suspend the rules, 3 separate meetings, 3 separate nights, by Paul Wertz, seconded by Ruth Detrow.  
Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move the Ordinance be passed by Robert L. Valentine W1, seconded by Ruth Detrow.  
Ayes: Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz  
Abstain: Stephen Stuart,*

Motion carried.

#### **Ord. 82-09**

Item (d) AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS AND ENTER INTO AN CONTRACT FOR THE SALE OF CERTAIN EQUIPMENT BELONGING TO THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO AND TO EXECUTE THE TITLE THERETO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. (1) 1998 Ford Vac Truck.

*Moved for non-reading in full by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1 to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W 1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

**Larry Paxton:** When we approached you we wanted to buy a new Vac truck and it was our promise at that time that the old unit would be sold. I believe the unit is worth more than \$5,000.00 dollars that is why we are asking for this permission to dispose of this old unit.

**Stephen Stuart:** And \$5,000.00 was the allowed trade-in value, is that what it is?

**Larry Paxton:** We believe the unit may be worth \$25,000.00 or something in that range.

**Stephen Stuart:** Were we offered a trade?

**Larry Paxton:** No.

**Stephen Stuart:** Could we have gotten a trade-in?

**Larry Paxton:** The vendor at that time would not offer a trade-in.

**Mayor Stewart:** There is a section of this Ordinance that I want you all to be aware of. The proceeds of this sale of said equipment to be deposited in the Sewer Fund, 611.

**Ruth Detrow:** So this 1998 Truck wasn't worn out?

**Larry Paxton:** It needed to be replaced. It was breaking down and it had some worn parts on it. It is more of an emergency vehicle when the sewer is broken or plugged. You needed a piece of equipment that will work right now and unfortunately the old truck continued to plague us with breakdowns.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Back to what you said, Glen. I have a question. Otherwise, have we done this in the past at any situation? That we put it into departments?

**Mayor Stewart:** The money has been put into departments as I recall, but I am not sure, and I can't answer your questions specifically about if it was included in an Ordinance or not. There is a reason for this. In discussing this with Rick Wolfe and Rick's son is in town and he is from Arizona and he is not here this evening. But in discussing similar issues with Rick Wolfe. If an Ordinance directs where the money is to go, that means Council is in concurrence or in agreement and that is where it will go. If it is not identified, it will go into the General Fund, although I think if you look back, you may find that it has gone to specific funds in the past but this is to rectify what may or may not have been history in the past.

**Stephen Stuart:** The 1998 truck that we are talking about was purchased initially with Sewer Funds.

**Mayor Stewart:** Yes, that is true.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Okay, that makes sense. I didn't know that.

**Mayor Stewart:** In some cases, General Funds. I just wanted to call this to your attention.

Questions or discussion?

*Move the Ordinance be passed on the 1<sup>st</sup> reading by Robert L. Valentine W1, seconded by Ruth Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to suspend the rules, 3 separate meetings, 3 separate days by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move the Ordinance be passed by Stephen Stuart, seconded by Robert M. Valentine W2*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine 2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Motion carried.

Resolutions:

**Res. No. 20-09**

Item (a) A FINAL RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SERVICE, TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR THE US RT 42 PAVEMENT REPAIRS, BRIDGE MAINTENANCE AND RESURFACING PROJECT WITHIN THE CITY CORPORATION LIMITS; TO BE FUNDED BY ACCOUNT NO. 204-1201-55501 WITH AN ESTIMATED COST OF \$20,456.00; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

*Moved for non-reading in full by Robert M. Valentine W2, seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1 to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Resolution has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

**Mayor Stewart:** This is the project south of town that part of that is in the city. We had some discussion on this four or five months ago. As a matter of fact, apparently they are getting about ready to open that.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Next Wednesday, I heard.

**Mayor Stewart:** There is a ribbon cutting next Wednesday.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Well, the good thing is you are not going to show it from underneath, because they are not painting the beams until in the spring. I already checked on it. I went out and looked at it today.

**Stephen Stuart:** We didn't get a chance to put a sign up there, did we?

**Mayor Stewart:** Do what?

**Stephen Stuart:** Put a sign up for our share of the cost?

**Mayor Stewart:** No we didn't. If you want to approve another \$20,000.00, I will get a sign.

Questions or comments?

*Move the Resolution be passed on the 1<sup>st</sup> reading by Robert M. Valentine W2, seconded by Ruth Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Resolution has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to suspend the rules, 3 separate meetings, 3 separate days by Paul Wertz, seconded by Ruth Detrow.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move the Resolution be passed by Ruth Detrow, seconded by Robert M. Valentine W2*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine 2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

Motion carried.

## WARD REPORTS

At- Large: Stephen Stuart

- (a) I received a call from a resident expressing concern and I suspect some you also received a call from the same person. Concern about the move of the City Health Department to the location of the former County Home. A question about the accessibility for people. If transportation would be provided; the cost of doing that. Questions about will there be services available in town at all.

**Mayor Stewart:** I had that dialogue with Al Sanders as late as this afternoon. They have not identified a place to do that. There will be transportation available, but not transportation provided at no cost.

**Paul Wertz:** When they originally discussed that with us, weren't they going to put a place in town one day per week?

**Mayor Stewart:** That is right.

**Paul Wertz:** So I think they need to pursue it.

**Mayor Stewart:** As I say, I talked with Al this afternoon and they have not found a place that they can do that. The commitment was made to do it in my opinion, and it has not happened yet. Now, they are scheduled to move I think it is the second week in December. Their phone systems are being installed as we speak. So to answer your question, yes it was agreed upon that that would happen and to date it has not. The opportunity for further discussion is certainly open.

**Howard Scanlan:** If you did have city owned property and you have your own city district, you would save \$16,000 dollars.

**Mayor Stewart:** No that is not true.

**Howard Scanlan:** The city pays \$16,000 dollars to the county for rent.

**Mayor Stewart:** That is correct. If you have two facilities, it does not necessarily mean that that is the entire cost. There are people, there is equipment. Even as late as a couple of weeks ago, when they received some of the influenza vaccine, they had to find; they were on the verge of, they had to find additional refrigeration that had recorders on it. So that kind of equipment is not cheap, that was an unusual situation for them but I am using that as an example of what a piece of equipment that would be duplicated. I am not happy with the way this is going because we had in my opinion, a verbal commitment that we would be in Ashland one day a week. There was no mention of additional cost. There was no mention, that I can recall, of anything other than we should be able to do that. I sat on that board.

**Paul Wertz:** I have had two different calls about it. Steve brought it up.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** I talked to two people; they are saying, “Well it is supposed to be Ashland City Health Department”.

**Mayor Stewart:** No, it is Ashland City/County Health Department.

**Ruth Detrow:** No, it is Ashland County/City Health Department.

**Mayor Stewart:** It is a combined department.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** That is why we brought them together here and had a couple of meetings relative to the possibility of joining the two into one and the meetings that were here, the discussion and my feeling, which I assume must have been wrong, was that if you brought them together, it would eliminate some duplication and cut some cost. And the report that was given; it didn't say anything about cutting cost. That was one thing and another thing, was the idea that the county has millage that they pay for the Health Department and we take we out of the General Fund.

**Mayor Stewart:** That is correct. We, the city, do not pay that millage.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** And that complicates it simply because, if we are joined together, how are you going to resolve that?

**Mayor Stewart:** That's right.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Because what you have to be doing is putting the tax on the people.

**Mayor Stewart:** It is very complex to say the least.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** I guess I was concerned to. It has been there for how many years? It is County/City. I am not disagreeing in any way with that about the amount of people who use it. I imagine if you say percentage wise, I could be wrong, but I would think the city people probably use it more than the county people do.

**Mayor Stewart:** I don't know that Bob.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** No, I don't either.

**Howard Scanlan:** Al Sanders would have that number. I have not connected with him today.

**Mayor Stewart:** I have not pursued that. You know, the County/City Health Department meets on the second Tuesday of each month at 7:00 p.m. and I would invite anyone who wants to come and share their thoughts, to please do so. There are five county and five city representatives and as a matter of fact, we the city have a vacancy due to a Resignation, very recently and if someone has an idea of someone that can make that meeting on a regular basis, I would be more than happy to consider that for an appointment. It meets between our meetings.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** No doesn't the county have theirs; the city has separate meetings?

**Mayor Stewart:** They are both together. We set on one side of the table and the county sets on the other side of the table. We vote on our things and they vote on their things and we both vote on common things.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** There wasn't a vote on moving it out there, they just told us where it was going?

**Mayor Stewart:** I was asked if I had an objection and at the time I wasn't significantly disenchanted with it; they needed space; I honored their need for space and that is when I asked that we have a clinic in the city of Ashland once a week and it was said "I don't see why we can't".

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Just as you represent the city at that meeting; on the county level, the commissioners change. Whoever is present.

**Mayor Stewart:** The commissioners do not attend that meeting. There are no commissioners that have ever attended that meeting during my one year and a half.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** That is what I was wondering about because I remember when I was president there.

**Mayor Stewart:** There are people from out in the townships that are on the county board.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Okay. Because I remember when we rotated the president and I remember meeting.

**Mayor Stewart:** I have been to a lot of the meetings now.

Ward 2: Robert M. Valentine

- (a) I had some trouble but Mr. Wolfe is not here. They took care of it. I had some lady call me about high grass a couple of weeks back and I called and left a message down there and they took it as another problem they were having on that street, so they took care of the other problem and they didn't do the grass, but then they did the grass. I worked out good.

Ward 1: Robert L. Valentine

- (a) I had a call from north Countryside, about a problem in the right-of-way, a driveway. I talked to the Engineer and he is looking into it.
- (b) I had an email about Creekview Court about lighting and discussed that with the Mayor and he gave me some background and I got back to the person. That took care of that.

**Mayor Stewart:** It is still being worked. On Redwood Bob?

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Creekview.

**Mayor Stewart:** Oh, I thought you were talking about lighting. There is no lighting there.

Ward 3: Ruth Detrow

- (a) I have learned of some concern about the condition of the marquis on the Theater downtown. It fell down, the part was underneath, it fell down a year ago, maybe. All the owners have done is take away the part that was hanging loose, but I have heard from people who are concerned because they think it is rapidly becoming an eyesore simply because nothing has been done. Not just becoming. I agree. So I haven't completed working on this yet. But I did want to mention the concern of a constituent.

Ward 4/ President: Paul Wertz

- (a) Both of my things were on the Health Dept. and Steve covered it.

Old Business: None

New Business:

- (a) The Audit committee needs to meet before the first of the year and I think there are two councilmen on it, the Mayor, Finance Director and a citizen. Do you want to set a date on that? I think it is Bob and Steve. Do you want to set a date up with the Mayor?

**Mayor Stewart:** I will make every effort to there whenever it is convenient and we have an outside person that you need to contact. Bernard Sargent.

**Paul Wertz:** So do one of you guys want to set the date?

**Stephen Stuart:** Glen, why don't you coordinate that because your calendar is probably busier than either Bob or mine?

**Mayor Stewart:** I don't know, when you want something done, a busy guy is the guy you call. I will take that on. I will contact you guys.

- (b) **Paul Wertz:** Also under New Business, I would just like to say: December 31<sup>st</sup> is my last day, so Sandra Tunnell is going to be the new councilmen for the fourth floor, so I would just like to introduce her to the rest of Council and everybody.

**Mayor Stewart:** Good evening.

**Sandra Tunnell:** Good Evening.

Mayors Comments:

I have several items I am going to cover this evening. And one of them involves an appointment. This evening I am making an appointment to fill the remainder of the term of the office vacated by the resignation of our former Finance Director. The term runs through December 31, 2011. We received unsolicited resumes; none of which were nearly as strong in the areas of government finance, civil service, bond/note issuance and other areas specifically focused on municipal government. I offer this appointment without hesitation as he has demonstrated his capability of all work with other Finance Division team members, gathering the required documents, reconciling accounts, preparing and completing reports required by our state auditors to complete the 2008 audit. Former associates in Shelby gave him very high marks as their Finance Director while he was employed by the city of Shelby. This is an unusual circumstance and important to note. We have had the opportunity of being able to evaluate his capability as well as his compatibility with the Ashland Finance Division team prior to actually making an appointment to fill the position. Along with the above observations, our current acting Director of Finance, Bill Strine, offers the following statement: Larry Paxton has extensive knowledge when writing to municipal finance. His background includes 22 years of Shelby's elected Finance Director, and 3 ½ years at the city of Ashland. He has proven communication skills, work experience with our city, capabilities and integrity make Larry the logical individual to bring stability to this division and carry on the operation of the Finance Office effectively and efficiently. At this time, I present Larry Paxton as my appointment for the office of Director of Finance, commencing November 23, 2009 through the end of the term December 31, 2011. I ask that this Council confirm the appointment by your motion and a positive vote this evening.

*Moved to confirm the appointment of Finance Director to the City of Ashland, State of Ohio, Larry Paxton by Stephen Stuart, seconded by Robert M. Valentine W2.*

*Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

**Mayor Stewart:** Larry asked me if he could have 30 minutes and I told him he could have until 8:00 p.m.

**Larry Paxton:** If I could make a couple of comments please. First of all, this appointment was very humbling for me. It is something I enjoy doing. I would like to thank the Mayor, Council members for the privilege and

the opportunity to serve my community. I also want to pledge to you my support and full cooperation as the Finance Director in the city of Ashland to work with the Mayor and his staff, you as Council members, other elected officials and departments as we continue to manage our community's local government. Thank you very much and I look forward to working with each and every one of you.

**Mayor Stewart:** Thank you Larry.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** The only comment I would like to make, is that "you are an elected official".

**Larry Paxton:** I would like to make one comment about the Mayor and Finance Director, Strine said 22 years, it was 11 years.

**Mayor Stewart:** Oh my, it must have seemed like it to me. I am going to ask Ellie Grubb to make a comment this evening. First Energy has called to see if we are ready to accept their offer of 200 and; fill in the blanks please.

**Ellie Grubb:** As you know the city approved electric aggregation with First Energy in 2001 and approximately 2 months ago we met with them; they are offering to actually 60 communities a very huge sum of money, a one time Grant, they are calling it. If we would renew our aggregation contract with them to 2018; now our current one is effective until 2012. The discount rate to residents will remain at 6% of their cost, not of the generation fee, but the delivery fee. The amount of money that they are offering is a one-time gift and would get a check before the end of the year is 234,360 dollars. They figured that amount on by using the number of people in the city of Ashland who opted in to the aggregation program. So it comes out to approximately \$30.00 dollars a person who opted into the aggregation program for the city of Ashland. They have offered this for a one time Grant to 68 communities and 53 of them have accepted it. We are one of the few that so far have not responded. 2018 sounds like a long way away but the one thing that is in this amendment to our master agreement with First Energy that the discount will never go below 6% for residents and it is 4% for commercial so for the three terms that they are talking about, 6% is as low as the discount would go. I quite frankly, and I say this, I don't know why they are doing this.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** What is the ulterior motive?

**Mayor Stewart:** I am very reluctant. I have talked to some Mayors at the Mayors meeting which we have another one Thursday up in Independence and at that time, a couple of Mayors that I talked to, their term was up at the end of the year. They quite frankly, said, we are not going to make that decision. But Ellie checked today, 53 out of 68 is what they are telling us.

**Ellie Grubb:** And some of the places are: Akron, Toledo, Barberton, Westlake, Euclid and they have accepted that.

**Ruth Detrow:** Have you checked it with the Ohio Consumers Council?

**Ellie Grubb:** Checked what?

**Ruth Detrow:** Is there anything that we need to know? I am just thinking it might be helpful.

**Ellie Grubb:** Well it is in compliance with the PUCO, which is Public Utilities Commission of Ohio.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Once we do this, we commit our people to this. We commit people in Ashland up until the year 2018. I trying to think there is an ulterior motive here.

**Ellie Grubb:** They are not committed. These individuals; you can opt out

**Paul Wertz:** Individuals can opt out.

**Robert M. Valentine W2,** You can pick whatever generator you want. They have a list.

**Ellie Grubb:** But there is only a specific time frame that you can do that. You just cannot do it anytime. It is usually like at the end of the year.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** But there is a big push for other sources of energy to provide. That is what worries me a little bit.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Well 53 out of 68 cities took the cash flow.

**Stephen Stuart:** Well that wouldn't preclude us, if for example, we want to do solar or wind generation as a city; that wouldn't prevent us from doing it.

**Mayor Stewart:** If we wanted to fill this roof with solar panels, there is no hook there. I have never received a gift from other than a relative or a close friend but what there was a hook in it. And First Energy is not a close friend or relative. They are a business entity.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** Is there a deadline?

**Ellie Grubb:** Yes, we need to do this before the end of this year.

**Robert M. Valentine W2;** Did Rick Wolfe see the difference between the two? Did he put one against the other?

**Ellie Grubb:** I don't know how he did it. I just know he has the material.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Okay, so he is supposed to be getting back eventually with you Mayor?

**Mayor Stewart:** He is looking at it from the legal aspect. He is not going to advise us financially.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Well, I understand that. I am just saying; I want to make sure that it is language wise; it is no different than the last one.

**Mayor Stewart:** Well, we are locking ourselves into 2018 with a minimum of a 6% discount on, I believe it is a transmission cost, not the generation cost.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Now, but we locked ourselves in from 2001 to 2012 and didn't get any money.

**Mayor Stewart:** No there were not any lump sum payments.

**Stephen Stuart:** And the percentage and discount wasn't any greater, right during that time?

**Mayor Stewart:** I intend to go to Independence again on Thursday. The Mayors and City Managers, Councils meeting again. I have an opportunity and I will ask Ellie to call the Ohio Consumer's Council. This is a beautiful time to get a hook because I don't know of a community that can't use a couple hundred thousand dollars. Akron got what?

**Ellie Grubb:** Oh, huge.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** That is better than renting your sewers.

**Stephen Stuart:** If, down the road, we act on this, you may want to think about putting that in a reserve fund for payment of our street lighting cost. It is less than two years would be the cost of our street lighting.

**Ellie Grubb:** One thing it says that; it is to do with what we want.

**Mayor Stewart:** Thank you Ellie. We will pursue that through the Ohio Consumers Council and anything else I can do.

**Robert L. Valentine W1:** You haven't heard anything more about the light bulbs have you?

**Mayor Stewart:** No. There are no free rides. I passed out the document on the 67.5374 acres that is golf course Land documented through several avenues that the golf course in fact financed this through the Waite family and we paid Waite family 5 or 6 installments. So it was golf course money that paid for it. You have in front of you a document that is not as pretty as this one but we didn't get colored ones I don't think. Anyway you got an A through F and those letters refer to the lots on this layout. There has been an indicator given to me that those people living on Fairview; that their lots back up to F down here and E up here have a desire, if we sell this land to buy a 75 foot buffer and the only ones I have heard from have been in this F area down here and I am told "the majority of those lot homeowners would like that". I personally, am not interested in selling postage stamps. In my opinion, it should be all or nothing. I cannot imagine anyone that buys this back here, especially if a farmer wants to move in and out of the lot lines. So with that being said, there is an access off of Fairview which is a lot 4251 and that is B which amounts to 2.324 acres. D which is a 75 foot, is another 1.29 acres and then the 44.55 and the 22.755 make up these what we would call A and C less E and F; so 65 net acres to sell if we sell the buffer. I have talked to several of you individually. We have appraisals of that land value from \$2800.00 an acre to \$3800.00 dollars an acre. We can put a for sale sign on it and advertise it. We can list it. We can auction it. We can auction it with a reserve. Or we can sit on it. I give you this good information. I have one appraiser; appraised value that is a licensed appraisal. The other two, and I don't mean this to be derogatory; the other two are realtors and quite frankly, there is a \$1,000.00 dollar an acre spread; but that is the way it is. What we are going to get out of it if we sell it? I don't know that. What is your preference and how do you think we should pursue the sale of this land?

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** On this buffer zone thing; that is the question I was going to ask you. I walked around back there. Most of those people have grass planted. They already have the buffer zone.

**Mayor Stewart:** But when we sell it, it goes away.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Without that buffer zone, on a lot of those yards, it makes a pretty small back yard.

**Mayor Stewart:** I would venture to say, if there are any second homeowners; any homeowners that are second or third from when their home was built and they haven't read all of their; they are going to be surprised.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Some of those are fenced in all the way back, too. You don't want to break the pieces off. I mean, it is a straight line?

**Mayor Stewart:** Yes. I am proposing that it be a straight line.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Right. And each person pays an X amount of dollars for the buffer zone?

**Mayor Stewart:** Yes.

**Ruth Detrow;** Yes. But they can't be forced to buy it. So there are going to be a few who say, "I can't afford it, or don't want to"; and there we'll have it. We will have a jagged boundary.

**Mayor Stewart:** The other way is just not to offer it to them.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** Just leave it grown up the way it is?

**Mayor Stewart:** No. Sell it. Then it becomes the homeowner vs the people that buy this. I don't really want to create a ruckus.

**Stephen Stuart:** Another option would be, while it wouldn't be a formal one. It would be similar to a homeowners association. You know if you offer it out there with the understanding that it is all or nothing. That it is all purchased, or none is purchased because why would you split it off from any other potential buyer and have a fragmented situation. So if you offer it that way, all or nothing, then if there is a holdout, then they may be other people that will come together and offset that holdout.

**Mayor Stewart:** E and F only amounts to 2.14 acres and lets say we get the top end of \$3800.00 dollars an acre. You are talking about \$8,000.00 dollars over 15 or 18 homeowners there.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** So it is not going to cost them that much for that chunk of land.

**Mayor Stewart:** \$16,000.00 dollars. If they all were to participate, they would be looking at maybe \$500.00 dollars.

**Robert M. Valentine W2:** I like exactly what Steve said; I think we ought to make it known that it is all or nothing.

**Mayor Stewart:** If they want to create an association to buy that, so be it.

**Stephen Stuart:** At \$3800.00, I think we are awfully low. If you look at it.

**Mayor Stewart:** I went with a professional.

**Stephen Stuart:** I understand that.

**Mayor Stewart:** And all three of them brought out the point that there is a single access. And I brought back to them that there is a single access to Creekview too. You know, I am not trying to argue. I am amazed at how low it went. I got three of them. One of them I know pretty well.

**Stephen Stuart:** You know, I personally lean towards an auction with a \$4000.00 dollar an acre reserve.

**Mayor Stewart:** Would the Council like to make that into a form of a motion?

**Stephen Stuart:** Well, I think we need to think about it.

**Mayor Stewart:** The ball is in the Council's court to come back.

**Stephen Stuart:** Can we have it on the Agenda for December?

**Mayor Stewart:** Fine with me.

Mayor's Comments: (cont'd)

Following the comments and questions from the audience, I am going to ask for an Executive Session that won't too terribly long but it is regarding the employment, salary and benefits of a public employee.

Comments of questions from the Audience: Items that are not included on the Agenda.

None.

*Motion to move to Executive Session by Robert M. Valentine W2 regarding the employment; salary and benefits of a public employee and no action will be taken when we come back in., seconded by Robert L. Valentine W1.  
Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert L. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

**Mayor Stewart:** I am going to and I have already invited Mrs. Tunnell to participate in this Executive Session.

Executive Session at 8:14 p.m.

*Move to reconvene back to Regular Session by Robert L. Valentine W1, seconded by Robert M. Valentine W2  
Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz.*

*Move to adjourn Regular Session by Robert L. Valentine W1, seconded by Ruth Detrow.  
Ayes: Stephen Stuart, Robert L. Valentine W1, Robert M. Valentine W2, Ruth Detrow, Paul Wertz*

ADJOURNMENT AT 8:45 p.m.

Submitted by  
Valarie Bishoff  
Clerk of Council